# BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

In re the appeal of the reexamination application of:

U.S. Patent No. 4,910,652

Gary E. Rhine

Reexamination Control No.: 90/005,694

Appeal No.: 2010-006734

Filed: April 3, 2000

For: COMBINATION WRIST WATCH AND

FLASHLIGHT

BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES United States Patent and Trademark Office P.O. Box 1450

Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

Exr. S. Husar
Art Unit: 2875

RECEIVED

MAY - 6 2010

BOARD OF PATENT APPEAUS

May 4, 2010

### U.S. EXPRESS MAIL CERTIFICATE

Express Mail No.:

EV 518809295 US

Date of Deposit:

May 4, 2010

I hereby certify that the following attached papers, Owner's Supplemental Response To Examiner's Supplemental Answer Filed March 31, 2010, and Exhibits A and B are being sent by U.S. Express Mail to Board of Patent Appeals and Interferences, United States Patent and Trademark, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria VA 22313-1450.

Respectfully submitted,

EMCH, SCHAFFER, SCHAUB & PORCELLO CO., L.P.A.

Lakey a. Burgess
Kathy A. Burgess

Date: May 4, 2010

### BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

In re the appeal of the reexamination application of:

Gary E. Rhine

Reexamination Control No: 90/005,694

Appeal No.: 2010-006734 Filing Date: April 3, 2000

Title: COMBINATION WRIST WATCH AND

**FLASHLIGHT** 

Art Unit: 2837

Examiner: Stephen F. Husar

RECEIVED

MAY - 6 2010

BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS
AND INTERFERENCES

# OWNER'S SUPPLEMENTAL RESPONSE TO EXAMINER'S SUPPLEMENTAL ANSWER FILED MARCH 31, 2010

BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES
UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE May 4, 2010
P.O. BOX 1450
ALEXANDRIA, VA 22313-1450

Sir:

This Supplemental Response is being filed in response to the Examiner's outrageous Supplemental Answer filed March 31, 2010. In the Supplemental Answer the Examiner argues that since United States Patent No. 4,910,652, the patent in this Reexamination, has expired, the claims cannot be amended pursuant to 37 CFR §1.530(j). The Reexamination of the '652 patent has been in process since April 12, 2000. It is respectfully submitted, that if this reexamination and appeal had proceeded in a timely manner, the issues now on

appeal to the Board of Appeals would have been resolved well in advance of the 2007 expiration of the '652 patent.

•

Owner Rhine submits that the reexamination proceedings were fairly timely through the Examiner's third Office Action and the Owner's Response to that Office Action dated August 27, 2002. The period of time from the Owner's Response on August 27, 2002, to the filing of the fourth Office Action in December 21, 2004, was 28 months. This is not a timely response on the part of the Examiner.

The final Office Action was filed on June 15, 2005. Owner Rhine filed his Notice of Appeal on August 10, 2005. Owner Rhine's Brief was filed on October 6, 2005, via USPS Express Mail. See Exhibit A to this Supplemental Response (Express Mail Certificate and a copy of the date stamped post card dated October 6, 2005, as received by the United States Patent & Trademark Office). On October 19, 2006, Owner Rhine filed a Request For Status Check due to the fact that, as of that date, there was no indication that the Brief was filed with the United States Patent Office (Exhibit B). No response to the Request For Status Check was ever received.

Owner Rhine received a Failure To Comply Notice from the Examiner dated February 19, 2008. The Failure To Comply Notice indicated that the Brief was filed on March 27, 2006. Owner Rhine questions the veracity of the Examiner's contention that the Brief was filed on March 27, 2006, rather than October 6, 2005. Owner Rhine further inquires as to why the bibliographic data when checked on October 19, 2006, indicates that the status is "Notice of Appeal filed". Even accepting that Owner Rhine's Brief was filed on March 27,

2006, why did the Examiner require nearly two years to file a Failure To Comply Notice (February 19, 2008).

In response to the Failure To Comply Notice an Amended Brief was filed on February 28, 2008, and a Substituted Amended Brief was filed on March 4, 2008. The Examiner's Answer was filed on January 30, 2009, again nearly one year after the filing of the Amended Brief.

On March 2, 2009, the Owner Rhine replied to the Examiner's Answer.

Now after more than a year, the Examiner files this Supplemental Answer.

Owner Rhine submits that, if the Examiner had timely filed the above noted papers, this Appeal of this Reexamination could easily have been resolved before the expiration of the '652 patent on March 19, 2007.

A review of the transaction history of this reexamination would indicate that the reexamination has pended for 10 years; of that time 5 years and 7 months have been lost due to inactivity on the part of the United States Patent & Trademark Office and the Examiner taking grossly excessive amounts of time to respond to Rhine's filings. If the Examiner's responses had been timely this appeal could have been resolved long prior to the March 19, 2007, expiration of the '652 patent.

Therefore, Owner Rhine respectfully requests that the Board of Appeals consider his arguments as presented in his Appeal Brief and supporting Affidavit in support of claim 1 as amended:

1. (As Amended) A time keeping and displaying wrist mountable watch having a flashlight mounted in the case thereof, said flashlight comprising a power supply for supplying electrical power to said flashlight, said power supply

electrically connected to at least one light source, and time delay means for automatically extinguishing said light source after a <u>fixed</u> time delay following the energization of said light source by the electrical deenergization of said light source.

Respectfully submitted,

James F. Porcello, Jr. Reg. No. 29,425

Emch, Schaffer, Schaub & Porcello Co., L.P.A. P.O. Box 916 Toledo, OH 43697-0916 JFP/kab

#### Certificate of Service

This is to certify that copies of the Owner's Supplemental Response To Examiner's Supplemental Answer Filed March 31, 2010, Exhibits A and B, and U.S. Express Mail Certificate, Certificate No. EV 518809295 were served on Scott Stimpson of Morgan Lewis, 101 Park Avenue, 42<sup>nd</sup> Floor, New York, New York 10178, Attorneys for Defendant, Casio, Inc. by regular United States mail on this 4th day of May, 2010.

James F. Porcello, Jr.

•	•			Say Say		•
·						
			<b>≥</b> EX	(PRESS	Cus	stomer Copy Label 11-F June 200
PEP V3	20 54E499		UNITED STATES POS	TAL SERVICE®	Post Office T	o Addresse
ORIGIN (POSTAL USE O	DNLY) by of Delivery   Flat Rate	Envelope	DELIVERY (POST Delivery Attempt	AL USE ONLY)	Employee Signature	
Date in	Next Decond Postage		Mo. Day Delivery Attempt	☐ AM ☐ PM	Employee Planeture	
100000	2 Noon 3 PM \$	365	Mo. Day	□ AM □ PM	Employee Signature	
- + +    - +    +    +    +    +	Italy Return Re	ecelpt Fee	Delivery Date	Time	Employee Signature	
	'I Alpha Country Code COD Fee	Insurance Fee	Mo. Day Waiver of signature is reco	AM PM	Honel merbhandles Insuran	od iš void ii
No/Delivery Ac	ceptance equivoltals Total Pos	tago & Foos	addresses or addresses's a location) and I sutherize the NO DELIVERY! Waste		fitional merbhandles Insuran be made without obtaining at e judges that article can be is nature constituted valid proof	ft in secure of delivery
GUSTOMER USE ONLY METHOD OF PAYMENT:	/ V // s	765	and top	- Francis C	Gusterner, S/gnature	
11	436274		Federal Agency Acct. No. or Postal Service Acct. No.			
FROM: (PLEASE PRINT)	anone (41 9) 243	1294	TO: (PLEASE PRINT)	PHONE		7
EMCH SCHAFFE 4 PORCELLO O PO BUX 916 TULFOO		597-0916	CUMMISS PU OUX ALEXAND	L4-50	PATENTS VA 22	313-1450
	₩ T#	077 0710	MAIL STOP	TTAR~		
_Rhine/00093/ba	am/appeal		L .			
PRESS HARD. You are making 3 copies. FC	DR PICKUP OR TRACK	(ING CALL 1-80	0-222-1811 ww	W.USDS.COM		
	AIL STOP TTAB				<u> </u>	
		694	ACE NO	00093		
	AL NO. 90/005, 4,910,6	52 Gary E.	ASE NO.	A KE	TED	• .
APPL FOR:	COMBINATION W				<u>. 1 Lul</u>	
	00/15/1///10// W	WID! WATCH	VUD LEVOUETI	JFP/	'bam	
	PATENT OFFIC NOWLEDGES R					
(Clair □ Draw □ Assig □ Decla	ring(s) ( shr nament nation and Powe	10-06-2005	I.D.S			
	l Entity Declarat.	L	IVIAIII	tenance Fee Tra M Application	nsmittal	: '* :: ·
NoE	V439669375US		☐ TM/S	M Exhibits(3)	_	ਤੂੰ EXH
인 Fees t )ther	\$500:00 (check) Applicant's B	rief on App	eal, includ	3 & 15 Declarati ing Affida	<u>vit o</u> f	STATE LEGAL
•	Gary E. Rhine	and Exhibi	ts A, /1, 🦪	2, A3, A4,	Bland C	11. ST.

**EXHIBIT** 

PTO/SB/21 (09-04)

Approved for use through 07/31/2006, OMB 0651-0031 U.S. Patent and Trademark Office; U.S. DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

Under the Paperwork Reduction Act of 1995, no per	sons are required to respond to a col Application Number	ection of information unle	ess it displays a valid OMB control number.
TRANSMITTAL	Filing Date	April 03, 2000	
FORM	First Named Inventor	Gary Rhine	DECENED
FORIVI	Art Unit	2875	RECEIVE
	Examiner Name	Stephen F. Husar	1 12 12 12 12 12 12 12 12 12 12 12 12 12
(to be used for all correspondence after Initial filing)	Attorney Docket Number	<del></del>	1
Total Number of Pages in This Submission	Attorney booker variber	00093	BOARD OF PATENT APPLICATION
EN	ICLOSURES (Check all	that apply)	AND MIEN
Fee Transmittal Form Fee Attached  Amendment/Reply After Final Affidavits/declaration(s)  Extension of Time Request Express Abandonment Request Information Disclosure Statement  Certified Copy of Priority Document(s) Reply to Missing Parts/ Incomplete Application Reply to Missing Parts under 37 CFR 1.52 or 1.53	Drawing(s)  Licensing-related Papers  Petition Petition to Convert to a Provisional Application Power of Attorney, Revocation Change of Correspondence A Terminal Disclaimer Request for Refund  CD, Number of CD(s)  Landscape Table on CD marks	A of A (A (	ppeal Communication to Board f Appeals and Interferences ppeal Communication to TC ppeal Communication to TC ppeal Notice, Brief, Reply Brief) roprietary Information tatus Letter ther Enclosure(s) (please Identify elow): Postcard
	OF APPLICANT, ATTO	RNEY, OR AGEN	Т
Firm Name Emch, Schaffer, Schaub & Porce	ello Co., L.P.A.		
Printed name  James F. Porcello, Jr.  Date	105 I	eg. No. 29,425	
	FICATE OF TRANSMISSI		
I hereby certify that this correspondence is being far sufficient postage as first class mail in an envelope the date shown below:	csimile transmitted to the USPTC addressed to: Commissioner for	or deposited with the Patents, P.O. Box 14	e United States Postal Service with 50, Alexandria, VA 22313-1450 on
Haster Q.	Luzers		
Typed or printed name Kathy A. Burgess	, 0	Da	ate 10/19/06

This collection of information is required by 37 CFR 1.5. The information is required to obtain or retain a benefit by the public which is to file (and by the USPTO to process) an application. Confidentially is governed by 35 U.S.C. 122 and 37 CFR 1.11 and 1.14. This collection is estimated to 2 hours to complete, including gathering, preparing, and submitting the completed application form to the USPTO. Time will vary depending upon the individual case. Any comments on the amount of time you require to complete this form and/or suggestions for reducing this burden, should be sent to the Chief information Officer, U.S. Patent and Trademark Office, U.S. Department of Commerce, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, VA 22313-1450. DO NOT SEND FEES OR COMPLETED FORMS TO THIS ADDRESS. SEND TO: Commissioner for Patents, P.O. Box 1450, Alexandria, VA 22313-1450.

If you need assistance in completing the form, call 1-800-PTO-9199 and select option 2.

ALL STATE LEGAL.

•		
Practitioner's Docket No	093	PATENT
IN THE UNITED STATES	PATENT A	ND TRADEMARK OFFICE
In re application of: Gary Rhine	. Ourse No. N	2875
Application No.: 090 / 005,694 Filed: April 03, 2000	Examiner:	Stephen F. Husar
For: COMBINATION WRIST W		
TOI.		
Assistant Commissioner for Patents	i	
Washington, D.C. 20231		•
STA	TUS INQUI	RY
14		we have heard anything on thi
1. More than months have p		ter.
the filing of this application	on	•
		om the Patent and Trademark Office
indicating action on this ap	plication.	
☐ AMENDED APPLICATIONS		
the filling of a response on	<del></del>	<u> </u>
No further communication in Office.	nas been rec	elved from the Patent and Trademark
☐ APPEALED APPLICATION		
The Appeal Brief was f	iled on	
(check and comp		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
☐ An Examiner's	Answer was	mailed on
		Answer was submitted on
ALLOWED APPLICATIONS		alend, trad gastimod on
the mailing of FORM POL-	327 and/or E	vaminer's Amendment on
the manning of Fortier Fortier	)	Antimer 3 Amendment on
CERTIFICATE OF MAILI	NQ/TRANSMIS	SION (37 C.F.R. 1.8(a))
I hereby certify that this correspondence is, on	the date shown	below, being:
MAILING		FACSIMILE
deposited with the United States Postal	☐ transmit	ted by facsimile to the
Service with sufficient postage as first class	Patent and	Trademark Office.
mail in an envelope addressed to the Assistant Commissioner for Patents,		
Washington, D.C. 20231.	· Lan	O Rus and
•	Signature	A fundam
Davis 10/19/04	Kath	y A. Burgess

(type or print name of person certifying)

2. Kindly advise the undersigned of the present status of this application, by checking the appropriate box below. A stamped return-addressed envelope is provided. NOTE: Status Inquiries should not be submitted for: NEW applications until a reasonable period after the Official Gazette indicates that the filing date of the "oldest new case" awaiting action in the group to which the application is assigned, is subsequent to the filing date of the application, or AMENDED applications within six (6) months after the filing of a response to which no reply from the PTO has been received, or ALLOWED applications where a notice of allowance is not received within three (3) months from the receipt of either a Form PTOL-327 of an Examiner's Amendment. See Notice of November 24, 1971 (893 O.G. \$10); M.P.E.P. § 203.08, 6th ed rev. SIGNATURE OF PRACTITIONER 29,425 Reg. No.: James F. Porcello, Jr. (type or print name of practitioner) P.O. Box 916 Tel. No.: (419) 243-1294 P.O. Address Toledo, OH 43697-0916 Customer No.: 20879 STATUS INQUIRY REPLY APPLICATION SERIAL NO. 0 /\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_ IS CURRENTLY · ASSIGNED TO GROUP \_\_ \_\_\_\_ AND AWAITS: ACTION BY THE EXAMINER. APPLICANT'S RESPONSE TO THE OFFICE ACTION MAILED

IS AWAITING ACTION BY THE BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS AND INTERFER-

**ENCES** 

☐ DATE OF HEARING EXPECTED \_\_\_\_

□ DECISION EXPECTED \_

(Status Inquiry [9-3]—page 2 of 2)

Bibliographic Data			
Application Number:	90/005,694	Customer Number:	-
Filing or 371 (c) Date:	04-03-2000	Status:	Notice of Appeal Filed
Application Type:	Re-Examination	Status Date:	08-20-2005
Examiner Name:	HUSAR, STEPHEN F	Location:	ELECTRONIC
Group Art Unit:	2875	Location Date:	-
Confirmation Number:	5900	Earliest Publication No:	-
Attorney Docket Number:	5965-021	Earliest Publication Date:	
Class / Subclass:	362/234	Patent Number:	-
First Named Inventor:	Gary Rhine(Owner) , Lima, OH	Issue Date of Patent:	-

Close Window



#### **United States Patent and Trademark Office**

Home | Site Index | Search | FAQ | Glossary | Guides | Contacts | eBusiness | eBiz Alerts | News | Help

**Portal Home Patents Trademarks** Other Patent eBusiness \_ 🗆 **Patent Application Information Retrieval Electronic Filing**  Patent Application Information Select Search Method: Enter Number: (PAIR) Application Number + Patent Ownership SUBMIT + Fees **Supplemental Resources &** Support Patent Information COMBINATION WRIST WATCH AND FLASHLIGHT Patent Guidance and General Info . 90/005,694 Codes, Rules & Manuals Application Transaction Image File Continuity Address & Employee & Office Directories Data History Wrapper Attorney/Agen Resources & Public Notices Transaction History **Patent Searches Transaction Description Date Patent Official Gazette** 08-10-2005 Notice of Appeal Filed **Search Patents & Applications Bearch Biological Sequences** 08-10-2005 Certificate of Service Copies, Products & Services 06-15-2005 Final Rejection Mailed 02-22-2005 Response after Non-Final Action Other 12-21-2004 Reexam Non-Final Action Mailed Copyrights **Trademarks** 10-07-2003 Scanned in Central Reexam Unit Policy & Law 08-27-2002 Response after Non-Final Action **Reports** 08-27-2002 Affidavit(s), Declaration(s) and/or Exhibit(s) Filed 06-28-2002 Scanned in Central Reexam Unit 06-27-2002 Reexam Non-Final Action Mailed 08-07-2001 Supplemental Response after Non-Final Rejection 07-10-2001 Certificate of Service 06-28-2001 Response after Non-Final Action 06-13-2001 Examiner Interview Summary Record 05-15-2001 Scanned in Central Reexam Unit 05-03-2001 Reexam Non-Final Action Mailed 10-20-2000 Timely Requestor's Reply to an Owner's Statement 08-23-2000 Timely Owner Statement in Response to Order 06-28-2000 Determination -- Reexam Ordered 04-26-2000 Case Docketed to Examiner in GAU 04-26-2000 Completion of Preprocessing - Released to Assigned 04-25-2000 IFW Scan & PACR Auto Security Review 04-12-2000 Correspondence Address Change Notice of Reexam Published in Official Gazette 05-16-2000

If you need help:

04-03-2000

Initial Exam Team nn

- Call the Patent Electronic Business Center at (866) 217-9197 (toll for about Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR).
- Send general questions about USPTO programs to the USPTO Contain
- If you experience technical difficulties or problems with this applications and applications of the use of the

Home | Site Index | Search | eBusiness | Help | Privacy Policy

Transaction History		
Date	Transaction Description	
08-10-2005	Notice of Appeal Filed	
08-10-2005	Certificate of Service	
06-15-2005	Final Rejection Mailed	
02-22-2005	Response after Non-Final Action	
12-21-2004	Reexam Non-Final Action Mailed	
10-07-2003	Scanned in Central Reexam Unit	
08-27-2002	Response after Non-Final Action	
08-27-2002	Affidavit(s), Declaration(s) and/or Exhibit(s) Filed	
06-28-2002	Scanned in Central Reexam Unit	
06-27-2002	Reexam Non-Final Action Mailed	
08-07-2001	Supplemental Response after Non-Final Rejection	
07-10-2001	Certificate of Service	
06-28-2001	Response after Non-Final Action	
06-13-2001	Examiner Interview Summary Record	
05-15-2001	Scanned in Central Reexam Unit	
05-03-2001	Reexam Non-Final Action Mailed	
10-20-2000	Timely Requestor's Reply to an Owner's Statement	
08-23-2000	Timely Owner Statement in Response to Order	
06-28-2000	Determination Reexam Ordered	
04-26-2000	Case Docketed to Examiner in GAU	
04-26-2000	Completion of Preprocessing - Released to Assigned GAU	
04-25-2000	IFW Scan & PACR Auto Security Review	
04-12-2000	Correspondence Address Change	
05-16-2000	Notice of Reexam Published in Official Gazette	
04-03-2000	Initial Exam Team nn	

Close Window